KARACHI PORT TRUST
CHIEF MECH & ELECT ENGINEER-I DEPARTMENT

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

(AS PER RULE 35 OF PP RULES, 2004)

1) Name Of Procuring Agency : **KARACHI PORT TRUST**

2) Method Of Procurement : **Notice for tender invitation through news paper published in Daily Business Recorder and Daily Jang Pakistan on 25.12.2024 and tender documents was uploaded on KPT & PPRA websites on 02.01.2025 under PPRA rule 36(b) i.e. single stage two envelope procedure.**

3) Title Of Procurement : **Miscellaneous Work of Above Water – Dredger TSHD Abul**

4) Tender Inquiry No : **GT/12/24**

5) PPRA Ref .No : **TS553856E**

6) Date & Time Of Bid Closing : **15 / 01 / 2025 at 1100 Hrs**

7) Date & Time Of Bid Opening : **15 / 01 / 2025 at 1130 Hrs**

8) No Of Bids Received : **Three Nos**

9) Criteria Of Bid Evaluation : **As per Tender Documents**

10) Details Of Bid(S) Evaluation : **Given below:**

Name of Bidder	Technical Marks (If applicable)	Rule/Regulation /SBD*/Policy/Basis Of Technical Rejection / Acceptance As Per Rule 35 Of PP Rules, 2004
M/s Al-Meena Marine Engineers	93 Marks Weightage= 65.1 out of 70	Qualified
M/s ESA Engineers	94.5 Marks Weightage= 66.15 out of 70	Qualified
M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd	75.5 Marks Weightage not calculated due to non-compliance of minimum qualifying marks in each category of Technical Evaluation criteria.	Disqualified

11) Any other additional / supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.
Attached

Signature : .....

Official Stamp : .....

17/3-25

CHIEF MECH. & ELECT. ENGINEER-I
MECH. & ELECT. DEPARTMENT
KARACHI PORT TRUST

KARACHI PORT TRUST
MECH & ELECT ENGG DEPTT

MISCELLANEOUS WORK OF ABOVE WATER DREDGER TSHD ABUL

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT

1. It is submitted that with the approval of competent authority the subject tenders were invite through press advertisement under PPRA rule 36 (b) (i.e. single stage two envelop procedure) and the same were published in the newspapers on dated 25-12-2024 and accordingly uploaded on KPT and PPRA websites. Tender bid opened on dated 15-01-2025.

2. In response following 03 bidders participated and submitted technical offers.
   I. M/s ESA Engineers.
   II. M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd.
   III. M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers.

3. In this regards, first meeting of technical evaluation committee was held in the office of CM&EE-I (Convener). The meeting was chaired by CM&EE-I and following members attended the meeting.
   I. CM&EE-I (Convener).
   II. DY.CME (W/S) (Member)
   III. DY.CME (F/C-I & II) (Member)
   IV. Asst. Manager Finance(Member)
   V. AEE (C) (Member)

4. During the meeting the technical proposal reviewed by above technical committee and discuses the technical proposal.

5. The second meeting of the committee was held in the CM&EE-I office and all the committee members attended the meeting. During the meeting technical proposal was reviewed by above technical committee and after detailed deliberations some discrepancies were observed in the bid documents of two firms i.e. M/s ESA Engineers & M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd regarding mandatory requirement of evaluation criteria and other terms & conditions and same were forwarded to Dy.CEE (S&C) vide letter No. /Misce Work of above water/25/10 dated 24-01-2025 wherein, the following shortcoming clarification were asked from the bidders to furnish:

CLARIFICATIONS:

A) M/s. ESA Engineers

a) Documentary proof of professional capability.
   i. Managerial staff C.Vs.
   ii. Technical Staff C.Vs.
   iii. Documentary proof work facility.

Contd....P/2

B). M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd.

a) Copy of PEC 03 years audited financial statement is to be provided showing minimum average turnover of 100 million
b) Copy of PEC certificate in relevant category as mentioned in mandatory requirement of Technical Evaluation Criteria.
c) Copy of experience Certificate for ship / crafts repair and maintenance contract as per TEC requirements.
d) Documentary proof of work facility as per TEC requirements.

6. In response, the above mentioned bidders submitted their clarification /desired shortcomings documents to DY.CEE(S&C) and same were received to Convener of TEC, through Dy. Chief Elect Engg (S&C) letter No.(M)GT/Misc work of above water/2024/63 dated 03-02-2025.

7. Later on, the third meeting of the committee held in the office of CM&EE-I and all committee members attended the meeting. The committee again discussed the response /documents received from the above two bidders and reviewed the mandatory conditions of evaluation criteria. The Technical Evaluation Committee scrutinized the clarification / documents furnished by both the firms. Further, TEC was of the view that the authenticity of the copies of purchase orders provided by M/s. AJCL towards their experience awarded by M/s. DAMEN are required to be checked / verified. In this regard, the Convener of TEC i.e. CM&EE-I sent an e-mail to M/s. DAMEN on 12-02-2025 (at 12:08 Pm) to confirm the genuineness of the said purchase orders. In response, M/s. DAMEN vide e-mail dated 12-02-2025 (02:52 Pm) confirmed the authenticity of the said purchase orders.

8. Later on, the fourth meeting of the committee was held in the office of CM&EE –I and all committee members attended the meeting. The committee again discus the response / confirmation received from M/s. DAMEN and is of the view that the copies of purchase orders submitted by M/s. AJCL towards their work experience are acceptable. In addition to above, Convener of TEC also asked vide letter dated 18-02-2025 that all 03 tendered participating firms may be asked to submit their User & work completion certificates of their work experience of purchase / work orders within 07 days. Accordingly, same were communicated to the respective firm vide letter dated 20-02-2025.

9. In response to above, two firms i.e. M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd vide their letter dated 24-02-2025 & M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers vide their letters dated 26-02-2025 furnished the desired documents. However, M/s. ESA Engineers vide their letter dated 25-02-2025 communicated that they have requested to M/s. KS&EW (i.e User) to furnished the User Certificate.

10. The Fifth meeting was held in the office of CM&EE –I, Committee Room, West Wharf on 27-02-2025 at 10:00 am. All committee members attended the meeting. The committee scrutinized the user certificates furnished by two firm i.e. M/s. AJCL & M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers and found acceptable. Further, reply of M/s. ESA Engineers was also discussed and agreed with the justification furnished by the firm. During meeting, one of the member of TEC i.e. DY.CME(W/S) was of the view that the work facility of M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd and M/s. ESA Engineers may be checked / verified on their given addresses through by KPT's Port Intelligence Department.

Contd....P/3

12. Accordingly, the Convener of TEC vide letter dated 27-02-2025 requested to Director Port Intelligence for verification of work facility of both the firms. It was confirmed by the KPT's Port Intelligence Deptt. to the TEC that the workshop inspection of both the firm's were conducted by KPT's Port Intelligence representatives on **28-02-2025**. Later on, Director Port Intelligence KPT vide his letter No. PID/299 dated 03-03-2025 reported as under:

S.No.	Firm / Workshop Address	Remarks
a.	**M/s. ESA Engineers** G-02, Located at Ground floor, Satar Chamber, 29th West Wharf, Karachi.	• The workshop exists at the given address (photographs is attached at **Flag 'A'**) • Copies of the lease agreement / rent deed, a list of managerial / technical staff and visiting card provided by representative of M/s. ESA Engineers are attached at **Flag 'B'**
b.	**M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd** Plot No. C-13, St-1/A, Sector 9, Cattle Colony, Korangi, Karachi	• The workshop exists at the given address but lacks a sign-board of the firm (photographs is attached at **Flag 'C'**) • No supporting documents have been provided by the representative to establish the workshop's association with the firm. However, letter from GM-Business Development AJCL Dated 28-02-2024 received by this office is attached herewith at **Flag 'D'**, which is self explanatory. • In this regard, TEC my obtain the documents/clarification from M/s AJCL(Pvt) Ltd, (if required).

13. In the meantime, M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd vide letter No. AJCL/CM&EE-II-KPT/LTR-250224-001483 dated 28-02-2025 (received in CM&EE-II office on 03-03-2025 vide IR # 430 dated 03-03-2025) wherein firm have communicated as under:

1 The KPT technical team has visited our proposed workshop facility as included in our technical bid package. During the site visit, the details and images submitted were thoroughly verified, confirming the accuracy of the information provided.
2 AJCL is available to provide the collaboration certificate / latter between IRE and AJCL Pvt Ltd upon request.
3 We have selected IRE as our exclusive partner due to our successful history of collaboration and their extensive experience working with KPT and Karachi Shipyard and Engineering Works. This strategic partnership underscores our commitment to fulfilling the requirements of the subject tender and ensuring its successful execution. Additionally, KPT's technical team has witnessed maritime jobs being undertaken at our facility, including the servicing of propellers and shaft bearings for a Karachi – based client, further demonstrating our technical capability and reinforcing the relevance of our expertise to the subject tender

Contd....P/4

14. Regarding provisioning of User Certificates, M/s. ESA Engineers vide heir letter dated 11-03-2025 furnished the desired documents and same appears as acceptable by TEC.

15. To conclude the TEC Report, the 6th and final meeting called by CM&EE –I (Convener) in the CM&EE Tender Committee Room No 32 KPT on 06-03-2025 at 12:00 pm and same attended by all the members of TEC. The TEC unanimously agreed that **after opening of the tender**, the matter communicated by M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd in letter No. AJCL/CM&EE-II-KPT/LTR-250224-001483 dated 28-02-2025 (received in CM&EE-II office on 03-03-2025 vide IR # 430 dated 03-03-2025) **regarding collaboration between M/s. IRE and M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd is not viable**. After threadbare discussion, TEC prepared /finalized the Technical Evaluation Criteria, Proforma 'A' & 'B', and also the concluded and recommends as under:

TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA

i. Mandatory Requirement

The firm should fulfill the following mandatory requirement / conditions and supporting documents should be submitted accordingly:

(Non compliance of any ***Mandatory Conditions*** will lead to rejection of bid).

S.#	Description	M/s Al Meena Engineers	M/s ESA Engineers	M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd
1.	In case of companies and firms, last 03 years Audited financial statements are to be provided showing minimum average turnover of Rs 100 million. OR In case of individuals / Sole proprietors, last 03 years tax returns filed with FBR are to be provided showing minimum turnover of Rs 100 million minimum on average for 03 years.	Complied	Complied	Complied
2.	The firm is not blacklisted by KPT or any other Government organization/Agency undertaking on Rs.100 /- stamp paper.	Complied	Complied	Complied
3.	Registration with Income Tax Deptt. Provide photocopy of valid NTN Certificate and Active Tax Payer List (ATL).	Complied	Complied	Complied
4.	Valid copy of SST & GST Certificate.	Complied	Complied	Complied
5.	Registration with Pakistan Engineering council, Registration Certificate in Technical category ME-04, ME-05, ME-06 and financial category C-4.	Complied	Complied	Complied
6.	The bidder shall submit their bid on original tender documents duly filled with each page signed and stamped against each column as token of acceptance.	Complied	Complied	Complied

Contd....P/5

7.	**a.** The bidder shall submit comparative of their technical specification against the KPT's tender specification duly filled with each column of each page and duly signed, stamped along with required original / copy of technical literature of offered equipment and drawings required in technical specifications. **b.** In case any deviation against the KPT technical specification; the same may be elaborated separately by the bidder.	Complied	Complied	Complied
8.	In case of Joint Venture (JV), the leading firm should be registered in Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) relevant category and having experience in shipbuilding / repair and maintenance of floating crafts.	N/A (Being not provided at the time of tender opening)	N/A (Being not provided at the time of tender opening)	N/A (Being not provided at the time of tender opening)

II. **TECHNICAL REQUIRMENT**

Minimum Qualifying Marks =**70% in each category**

The points / marks shall be given in the following manners:

Summary of marks / points

	Category	Maximum point / marks	To qualify Minimum points to be scored separately in each category
a.	Status of firm	10	7 i.e. 70% of 10 marks
b.	Professional Capability	30	21 i.e. 70% of 30 marks
c.	Relevant Experience	40	28 i.e. 70% of 40 marks
d.	Financial	20	14 i.e. 70% of 20 marks
	Total	100	70 i.e. 70% of 100 marks

Contd....P/6

S.#	Description		M/s Al Meena Engineers	M/s ESA Engineers	M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd
a.	**STATUS OF FIRM :** (Max. marks 10) (Min. marks 07)				
	i. Private Limited / corporation ii. Partnership iii. Proprietor	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks	04	3.5	05
	i. Completion of 15 years of firm established ii. Completion of 10 years of firm established iii. Completion of 08 years of firm established iv. Below 08 years of firm established (Evidence to be provided)	05 marks 04 marks 3.5 marks 00 marks	05	05	04
	Total		**09 Marks**	**8.5 Marks**	**09 Marks**

12/3/25

12/3/25

12/3/25

12-03-25

Contd....P/7

b.	PROFESSIONAL CAPABILITY (Max. marks-30) (Min marks 21)		M/s Al Meena Engineers	M/s ESA Engineers	M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd
	i. **Managerial staff. (10 Marks)** • CEO / Director (15 years experience) • Director / General Manager Engineering/ Technical (10 years experience) • Director / General Manager Finance (10 years experience)	10 marks 8.5 marks 07 marks	10	10	8.5
	ii. **Technical staff.(10 Marks)** Provide detail of technical staff involved in shipbuilding / repair & maintenance of floating Craft. • Marine / Naval Architect Engineer having 08-10 years experience in shipbuilding / repair and maintenance of floating craft. • Mechanical / Electrical /Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 08 – 10 years experience in ship / craft repairing. • Mechanical / Electrical /Electronic / Mechatronics Engineer having 05 – 08 years experience in ship / craft repairing	10 marks 8.5 marks 07 marks	10	10	10
	iii. **Work Facility (10 marks)** Detail to be provided, regarding miscellaneous work of floating craft, repairing workshop facility, fully equipped with machine & tools required for subject work having following accessories. ▪ Repairing facility for floating craft (workshop facility) ▪ Electrical and Mechanical facilities. ▪ 24/7 facility for diagnosing faults.	04 marks 03 marks 03 marks	04 03 03	04 03 03	00 00 00
	Total		30 Marks	30 Marks	18.5 Marks (Less than minimum qualifying marks i.e. 21 marks)

12/3

12/3/25

12/3/25

12/3/25

12-03-25

Contd....P/8

c.	**EXPERIENCE OF FIRM** **(Max. Marks-40) (Min Marks 28)** Give reference to (documentary proof)		**Al Meena Engineers**	**M/s ESA Engineers**	**M/s AJCL Engineers**
	EXPERIENCE OF FIRM ▪ 07 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats). ▪ 05 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats). ▪ 03 projects for ship / craft repair and maintenance contracts i.e. (TSHD, Bucket Dredger, Hopper Barge, Tugs, Floating Cranes, Ferry Boats.	**40 marks** **34 marks** **28 marks**	**34**	**40**	**28**
	Total		**34 Marks**	**40 Marks**	**28 Marks**
d.	**FINANCIAL SOUNDNESS** (Max. marks-20) (Min. marks-14)		**Al Meena Engineers**	**M/s ESA Engineers**	**M/s AJCL Engineers**
	Turnover Rs 250 Million and above. Rs 200 Million and less than Rs 250 Million. Rs 150 Million and less than Rs 200 Million. Below Rs 150 Million.	**20 marks** **16 marks** **14 marks** **00 marks**	**20 marks**	**16 marks**	**20 marks**
	Total		**20 Marks**	**16 Marks**	**20 Marks**

Formula for evaluation:	**M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers**	**M/s ESA Engineers**	**M/s AJCL (Pvt) Ltd**
Technical Score = **Bidder's Technical Score** X 70 / **Total Technical Score**	**93x70 / 100** **= 65.1 Scores**	~~93x70~~ 94.5 / 100 **= 66.15 Scores**	**Failed**
Grand Total (a+b+c+d)	**93 Marks**	**94.5 Marks**	**75.5 Marks**

Contd....P/9

RECOMMENDATIONS.

i. The Technical Evaluation Committee unanimously declares the Technical Proposal / Bid of two firms i.e. M/s. ESA Engineers and M/s. Al Meena Marine Engineers as **"Technically Responsive and acceptable"**. Therefore, recommends that the Financial Bids of both the firms may be opened after obtaining necessary approval of the Competent Authority.

ii. The Technical Evaluation Committee unanimously declares the Technical Proposal / Bid of M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd as **"Technically Non -Responsive and Not acceptable"** due to the reason that in the Technical Evaluation Criteria category "Professional Capability, the firm have obtained 18.5 Marks which is Less than minimum qualifying marks i.e. 21 Marks. Therefore, TEC recommends that the sealed Financial Bid of M/s. AJCL (Pvt) Ltd may be returned to firm after obtaining necessary approval of the Competent Authority.

12-03-25

Asst. Elect. Engineer (c)
(Member)

12/3/25

Asst. Manager Finance
(Member)

12/3/25

DY. Chief Mech Engineer (W/S)
(Member)

12/3/25

DY. Chief Mech Engineer (F/C – I & II)
(Member)

12/3

Chief Mech. & Elect Engineer – I
(Convener)